The Cost-Effectiveness of Life-saving Interventions in Japan Do chemical regulations cost too much money?

Atsuo Kishimoto^{a,c,*}, Tosihiro Oka^{b,c}, Junko Nakanishi^{a,c}

^a Research Center for Chemical Risk Management, National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology, 16-1 Onogawa, Tsukuba, Ibaraki 305-8569, Japan
^b Fukui Prefectural University, 4-1-1 Kenjojima, Matsuoka-cho, Fukui 910-1195, Japan
^c CREST, Japan Science and Technology Corporation, Japan
* Corresponding author. Tel.: +81-298-61-8297; fax: +81-298-61-8796; e-mail: kishimoto-atsuo@aist.go.jp

Abstract

This paper compares the cost-effectiveness of life-saving interventions in Japan, based on information collected from the health, safety and environmental literature. More than 50 life-saving interventions are analyzed. Cost-effectiveness is defined as the cost per life-year (LY) saved or as the cost per quality adjusted life-year (QALY) saved. We find a large cost-effectiveness disparity between chemical controls and healthcare intervention, and we discuss whether or not chemical regulations cost society too much. We point out the limitations of this study and propose a way to improve the incorporation of morbidity effects in cost-effectiveness analysis.

Key Words: cost-effectiveness analysis, life-year, quality adjusted life-year, chemical regulation

1. Introduction

The idea of prioritizing interventions based on the results of cost-effectiveness analysis has become widely accepted in the health, safety and environmental fields. In particular, the numbers of published reports on the cost-effectiveness of clinical and public health have increased continually, since 1960s (Elixhauser et al. 1998). Some countries have formally adopted cost-effectiveness analysis in their evaluations of pharmaceuticals. In that respect, guidelines regarding cost-effectiveness analysis have already been published in Australia, Canada, some European countries and elsewhere (Kanavos et al. 2000). In the United States, the Panel on Cost-Effectiveness and Medicine was commissioned by the US Public Health Service and made several recommendations (Gold et al. 1996). Since economic analysis has become universal in the journal articles, the British Medical Journal set up a working group and published guidelines for economic evaluation in order to improve the quality of submitted and published economics articles (Drummond and Jefferson 1996). To achieve comparability among studies, such guidelines usually recommend the use of "life-years" (LYs) or "quality adjusted life-years" (QALYs) as the measure of an intervention's effectiveness.

In the field of chemical risk management, the idea of "risk ranking" is more common than cost-effectiveness analysis in prioritizing control measures. While cancer risk can be described in terms of the number of lives lost or the number of life-years lost, the non-cancer risk of a chemical is ordinarily expressed by a hazard quotient, which is the ratio of the estimated dose and the reference dose. Therefore, in estimating health risks from air pollutants, Morello-Frosch et al. (2000) separated the risk rankings of carcinogens and non-carcinogens. Gamo et al. (1995) developed the method of comparing the risks of carcinogens and non-carcinogens using "loss of life expectancy" as the common effectiveness measure. Applying this method, Gamo et al. (2001) showed

2

the risk ranking of chemical substances in Japan. It is noted that the ranking of risk is not necessarily equal to the prioritizing of control measures, since not only "risk" but also "control cost" are taken into account in the context of both individual and public decision-making. Therefore, as is the case with healthcare, cost-effectiveness ratios should be calculated and priority given to policies with the best values. However, the number of articles reporting on the cost-effectiveness of chemical substance control measures is still small, and there are no guidelines for conducting cost-effectiveness analyses of chemical substance controls. We conducted several cost-effectiveness analyses of chemical control measures in Japan using the same methodology. Some of the results are shown in Figure 1.



Fig. 1. Cost-effectiveness of various chemical substance control measures in Japan.

In this paper, we regard chemical risk reduction as a part of life-saving interventions and assess whether or not chemical regulations are justified from a cost-effectiveness

perspective. To begin that assessment, we collected information on the cost-effectiveness of life-saving interventions in the health and safety fields in Japan, allowing us to compare their cost-effectiveness with that of chemical substance control measures. We then discuss a way to gain intersector comparability.

2. Life-saving interventions

Since the purpose of chemical regulations is to avoid adverse health effects, we need to look at the problem of cost-effectiveness from a wider point of view. We recently estimated the "cost per LY saved" of dioxin control measures at municipal solid waste incinerators in Japan (Kishimoto et al. 2001). A schematic illustration is shown in Figure 2.



Fig. 2. Schematic illustration of dioxin control measures at municipal solid waste incinerators.

Although Figure 1 shows that emergency countermeasures to reduce dioxins are quite

cost-effective and that long-term countermeasures are of average cost-effectiveness compared to other environmental measures, we do not know whether emergency and long-term countermeasures are cost-effective or not compared to other primary, secondary and tertiary prevention measures. We need to know the place of chemical risk management in the overall picture of life-saving programs, which is shown in Figure 3. In the case of cancer prevention, too much focus on environmental carcinogens draws public attention away from the more important causal factors, such as tobacco use, diet, obesity and lack of exercise, since environmental pollution accounts for only 2% of all cancer cases (Harvard Center for Cancer Prevention 1996).



Fig. 3. Overall picture of life-saving interventions.

Tengs et al. (1995) compared more than 500 life-saving interventions in the U.S. in terms of "cost per LY saved" and found a large disparity in the median "cost per LY saved"

between chemical risk management and other forms of intervention. In that study, the median toxin control cost \$2.8 million per LY, while the median medical intervention cost \$19,000 per LY. Ramsberg and Sjorberg (1997) also found such disparities in Sweden. If secondary and tertiary preventions are much less expensive, it is possible to insist that primary preventions are not necessary. Therefore, information on the cost-effectiveness of life-saving interventions in Japan from the health and safety literature is collected and compared with the cost-effectiveness of chemical substance controls.

3. Cost per Life-Year Saved

3.1 Method

Various life-saving interventions were collected from the healthcare and safety literature. We define cost-effectiveness as the cost per LY saved or the cost per QALY saved. Although we did not recalculate those results using a common criterion for standardization (due to a lack of information for a basic data set), all analyses included in this study met the following criteria: They contain information on life-saving interventions in Japan, and they report cost per LY saved or cost per QALY saved (or information sufficient to calculate them). Although costs should be expressed in the value of the Yen for some standard year, they are not, since the studies are limited to those published within the past decade.

3.2 Results

The life-saving interventions are classified into four categories: chemical control, safety control, disease prevention, and medical treatment. The number of observations and

6

median numbers for these categories are shown in Table 1. The distribution of cost per LY saved and cost per QALY saved estimates are shown in Figure 4, ranging from those that save more resources than they consume, to those costing more than 10 billion Yen per LY saved. Those studies are classified into two study types: retrospective and prospective. A retrospective study deals with life-saving interventions that are actually in use, while a prospective study deals with alternative or hypothetical life-saving interventions. The Appendix lists all life-saving interventions.

Category		n	Mean	Median
Chemical control	retrospective	16	658,000	103,000
	prospective	4	1,670,000	1,030,000
	all	20	860,000	140,000
Safety control	retrospective	2	160,000	16,000
	prospective	1	30,000	30,000
	all	3	20,700	27,000
Disease prevention	retrospective	23	5,400	4,100
	prospective	17	13,300	2,100
	all	40	8,800	3,300
Medical treatment	retrospective	26	1,600	600
	prospective	5	5,000	6,200
	all	31	2,100	970
All	retrospective	67	160,000	4,400
	prospective	27	257,000	4,100
	all	94	188,000	4,100

Table 1. Mean and median of cost per LY or QALY saved.

 \ast All costs are expressed in Yen. "N" indicates the number of observations.



Fig. 4. Distribution of cost-effectiveness ratios (n = 94).

Table 1 and Figure 4 show that the cost-effectiveness of risk-reduction policies varies enormously between different sectors, in the same manner as the findings of similar analyses in the United States and Sweden (Tengs et al. 1995, Ramsberg and Sjoberg 1997).

4. Discussion

Chemical regulations seem to be much less efficient than healthcare interventions. However, before drawing any conclusions, several caveats need to be noted in interpreting these results. First, as Tengs et al. (1995) pointed out, there are some limitations in this kind of study, such as the accuracy of the data, the validity of the assumptions upon which the original analyses were based and the representativeness of the interventions as a random sample of all life-saving interventions. Second, studies of this type can be classified into retrospective and prospective, as presented in Appendix A. The former interventions are already implemented, whereas the latter are only proposed. However, there is no significant difference between them in cost per LY or QALY saved estimates. Two factors may have some role here. For one, those interventions that have already been adopted are more cost-effective, since cost-effective measures are preferred and are followed by less cost-effective ones. For another, prospective studies may tend to take those potential interventions that are less expensive than those already done. Third, healthcare researchers have incentives to demonstrate that their interventions should be adopted widely and be covered by the national medical insurance. For example, the medical literature may contain an upward bias in the estimates of effectiveness and a

downward bias in the estimates of cost per LY or QALY saved. This is called "publication bias". Freemantle and Mason (1997) classified publication bias in economic analyses into three levels: first, in the health-outcomes data available for modeling; second, in the motivations for conducting an economic analysis; and third, in repeating the process of seeking publication. Fourth, many of the chemical regulations have benefits other than life-year saved, such as morbidity reductions and ecological impacts. In order to compare chemical regulations with healthcare interventions, we should incorporate into our calculations not only the loss of life expectancy that can be estimated quantitatively, but also various morbidity effects and ecological impacts. Some morbidity effects will be described using the quality of life index, such as quality adjusted life-years. However, since other potential effects are difficult to estimate quantitatively, it is necessary to develop a method to incorporate expert judgment and public risk perception into cost-effectiveness analysis.

In order to overcome these limitations, a standardized methodology of cost-effectiveness analysis should be developed for application to environmental, safety and healthcare interventions. One important attempt is being made by the WHO (Murray et al. 2000). The WHO is currently developing guidelines on generalized cost-effectiveness analysis of "environmental health interventions". That project aims to emphasize not only curative treatment, but also environmental and social measures.

Acknowledgement

This work was supported by CREST (Core Research for Evolutional Science and Technology) of the Japan Science and Technology Corporation (JST).

Appendix A. Life-saving interventions and their cost-effectiveness

9

Chemical control Absterment messure for sprayed-on asbestos 120,000 Murayama(1991) LY P Abstement messure for sprayed-on asbestos 36,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Mercury control 36,000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Prohibition of the mercury indry batteries 22,000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Control of trinadomethane(THM) 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of trinadomethane(THM) 230,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R High-level treatment of water supply groundwater pollutant earator 12,0000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Water purifier for home 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Recovery of chorofluorcoarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Rudigrefecture 380,000 Oka(1997) LY R R Prohibition of chorofluor coarb	Interventions	Cost per LY or QALY saved (thousand yen)	Sources	Endpoint	Type of Studies
Asbesten measure for sprayed-on asbestos 120.000 Murayama(1991) LY P Abatement measure for sprayed-on asbestos 36,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Rencury control Prohibition of the mercury electrode process in caustic 570,000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Barzane control Control of themercury in dry batteries 22,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Benzene control Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Ozone layer profeture 8,800 O Oka(1997) LY R H'yap prefecture 8,900 O Oka(1997) LY R H'ogo prefecture 130,000 O Oka(1997) LY R Hox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka al.(1997) LY R Hox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka (1997) LY R Hox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka (1997) LY R Hox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka (1997) LY R I'raffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al.(2001) LY R Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al.(2001) LY R female, 40s 6,400 Babazoon and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 1,000 Babazoon and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 4,100 Babazoon and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 4,100 Babazoon and Hillman(1995) LY R fem	<chemical control=""></chemical>	•			
Abstement measure for sprayed-on asbestos 120,000 Murayana(1991) LY P Mercury control Prohibition of the mercury electrode process in caustic 570,000 Nakanishi et al. (1988) LY R Prohibition of the mercury in dry batteries 22,000 Nakanishi et al. (1988) LY R Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1988) LY R Control of trahalomethane(THM) Division 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 1,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Recovery of chloroflucrocarbons Fucui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Robust of chlordlucrocarbons Fucui prefecture 30,000 Oka(1997) LY R Robust of chlordlucrocarbons Fucui prefecture 30,000 Oka(1997) LY <td>Asbestos control</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	Asbestos control				
Abstement measure for sprayed-on asbestos 36,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Prohibition of the mercury electrode process in caustic 570,000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Benzene control 22,000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihare et al. (1998) LY R Control of themetane for water supply groundwater pollutant sertor 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant C 1,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R To place for treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons F 1900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R To	Abatement measure for sprayed-on asbestos	120,000	Murayama(1991)	LY	Р
Mercury control Prohibition of the mercury electrode process in caustic 570.000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Removal of mercury in dry batteries 22.000 Nakanishi (1995) LY R Control of benzene in gasoline 230.000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of trahatomethane(THM) 12.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility, treatment plant A 7.700.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility, treatment plant D 2.200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility, treatment plant D 2.200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Water purifier for home 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fk/ku prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Row regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R R Myogo prefecture 30,000 Oka(1997) LY R Cork reduction regulation 75,000 Oka(Abatement measure for sprayed-on asbestos	36,000	Kishimoto(1997)	LY	R
Prohibition of the mercury electrode process in caustic 570.000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Removal of mercury in dry batteries 22.000 Nakanishi et al. (1998) LY R Benzene control 230.000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of themsene in gasoline 230.000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of themsene in gasoline 12.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3.700.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1.800.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1.900.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Ozone layer protection R 4.500.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40.000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130.000 Oka(1997) LY R <t< td=""><td>Mercury control</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>	Mercury control				
soda production Removal of mercury in dry batteries 22,000 Nakanishi(1995) LY R Benzene control Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Teleficient treatment of water supply groundwater pollutant aerator 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 1,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Facovery of chlorofluorocarbons Facovery of chlorofluorocarbons Facovery of chlorofluorocarbons Tokyo prefecture 88,000 Oka(1997) LY R Gifu prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Conce regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al.(2001) LY Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 15,000 Kishimoto et al.(2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al.(2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al.(2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R female, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hilman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hilman(1995) LY R female, 60s Kishimoto(1997) LY R Kagosh	Prohibition of the mercury electrode process in caustic	570,000	Nakanishi et al. (1998)	LY	R
Removal of mercury in dry batteries 22,000 Nakanishi(1995) LY R Benzene control Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of thialmenthane(THM) 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R groundwater pollutant earstor 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 18,00,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant C 12,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Rescurey of chioroflucrocarbons Fickui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Roky op refecture 380,000 Oka(1997) LY R Toky op refecture 1900,000 Oka(1997) LY R Probibition of chlordane 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Toky op refecture 1900,000 Oka(1997) LY R Conce thore the the the the the the t	soda production				
Benzene control Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of trihalomethane(THM) High-level treatment of water supply groundwater pollutant aerator 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 12,000,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Grone layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fuki prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Pohibition of chlordane 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Pohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka(1997) LY R Cost eventorin regulation 75,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Long term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Safety control) Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R female, 00s 1,200 Babazone and Hillmar(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazone and Hillmar(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazone and Hillmar(1995) LY R female, 700 Okubo et al.(1997) LY R female, 700 Okubo et al.(1997) LY R female, 700 Okubo et al.(1997) LY R female, 700 Oku	Removal of mercury in dry batteries	22,000	Nakanishi(1995)	LY	R
Control of benzene in gasoline 230,000 Kajihara et al. (1998) LY R Control of trihalomethane(THM) High-level treatment of water supply groundwater pollutant earstor 12,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Tescurey of chiorofluorocarbons Fickui prefecture 10,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Cone layer protection Recovery of chiorofluorocarbons Fickui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 30,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 150,000 Kiehimoto et al. (2001) LY Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,000 Kiehimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kiehimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kiehimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kiehimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kiehimoto et al. (2001) LY R male, 60s 1,000 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,000 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 1,000 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 4,100 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R femal	Benzene control				
Control of trihalomethane(THM) High-level treatment of water supply groundwater pollutant aerator 12000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 1,2000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R male of treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Gifu prefecture 4,0000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 4,0000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 3,0000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 3,0000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 3,0000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 15,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka(1997) LY R Traffic safty facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Safety control) Readers at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Safety control) Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R fraffic safty facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 40s 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 4,000 Kishimoto et al.(1997) LY R Mass screening for ung cancer al (1987-1992) 8,00 Kishimoto et al.	Control of benzene in gasoline	230,000	Kajihara et al. (1998)	LY	R
High-level treatment of water supply groundwater politant a reator12.000Akashi and Yasuda(1994)LYRTHM removal facility: treatment plant A3,700,000Akashi and Yasuda(1994)LYRTHM removal facility: treatment plant B1,800,000Akashi and Yasuda(1994)LYRTHM removal facility: treatment plant D2,200,000Akashi and Yasuda(1994)LYRWater purfier for home2,200,000Akashi and Yasuda(1994)LYRin place of treatment plant B1,900,000Akashi and Yasuda(1994)LYPOzone layer protectionRecovery of chlorofluorocarbonsFukui prefecture40,000Oka(1997)LYRRecovery of chlorofluorocarbonsTekkui prefecture80,000Oka(1997)LYRNOx reduction regulation75,000Oka(1997)LYRTokyo prefecture390,000Oka(1997)LYRDixin control75,000Oka(1997)LYREmergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators7,900Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYP <csfety control="">Csafety facilities for pedestrians5,000Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYRTraffic safety facilities for pedestrians5,000Kishimoto et al. (1997)LYRTraffic safety facilities for pedestrians5,000Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYRTraffic safety facilities for pedestrians5,000Kishimoto et al. (1997)LYRTraffic safety facilities for Gifu city<</csfety>	Control of trihalomethane(THM)				
groundwater pollutant aerator 12.000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R ThM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Guene layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 330,000 Oka(1997) LY R Doxin control Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Colleges prevention Case spreyening Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for Gfu oity 3,000 Akayama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Mass coreaning for gastric cancer males for Ging fagstric cancer male, 60s 1,200 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R familes 1,500 Tauji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Akayama and Suzuki(1997) LY R famale, 60s 4,100 Babazone and Hillman(1995) LY R famale, 60s 4,100 Babazone an	High-level treatment of water supply				
THM removal facility: treatment plant A 3,700,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant C 1,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Water purifier for home 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Corne layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 88,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 300,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka(1997) LY R Dioxin control Emergency contermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Casafety facilities for pedestrians 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Oliceas preventior) Casafety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (1997) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 2,010 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s Kishimoto et al. (1997) LY R female, 70s 4,000 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 4,000 Kusano et al.	groundwater pollutant aerator	12,000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	LY	R
THM removal facility: treatment plant B 1,800,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant C 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Water purifier for home 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Water purifier for home 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 4,000,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 4,0000 Oka(1997) LY R Gifu prefecture 6,80,000 Oka(1997) LY R Toky prefecture 390,000 Oka et al. (2001) LY R Dixin control Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R C Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gatric cancer males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R fema	THM removal facility: treatment plant A	3,700,000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	LY	R
THM removal facility: treatment plant C 1.200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2.200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Coone layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R Gifu prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibiton of chlordane 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibiton of chlordane 45,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Cover governmeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Safety control) Cover governmeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Cover safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Cover safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Cover safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P (Cover sourcermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R m ande, 40s 64,00 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 40s 64,00 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R females, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R fem	THM removal facility: treatment plant B	1,800,000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	LY	R
THM removal facility: treatment plant D 2,200,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY R Water purifier for home 1,300,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,300,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Ozone layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R R Tokyo prefecture 100 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 150,000 Oka(1997) LY R R Tokyo prefecture 100 No Red 119 No R Tokyo prefecture 100 No Red 119 No R Tokyo prefecture 100 No R No No	THM removal facility: treatment plant C	1,200,000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	LY	R
Water purifier for home 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Ozone layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R More of treatment plant A 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Nox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Cons centrol Safety control Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Castery facilities for pedestrians 2,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Castery facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for glocity 30000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1991) LY P Colesaes prevention> Cacer screening Mass screening for gastri	THM removal facility: treatment plant D	2.200.000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	LY	R
in place of treatment plant A 4,500,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Ozone layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka (1997) LY R Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P <a href="style="</td> <td>Water purifier for home</td> <td>, ,</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	Water purifier for home	, ,			
in place of treatment plant B 1,900,000 Akashi and Yasuda(1994) LY P Ozone layer protection Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Gifu prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hygo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 300,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 30,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 30,000 Oka(1997) LY R Conserver countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Conserver screening 50,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R females 610 Tsuji et al.(191a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 4,100 Babazono and Hil	in place of treatment plant A	4.500.000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	LY	Р
Ozone layer protection Notion of Detail (1997) LY R Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukuli prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Gifu prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 130,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Doxin control 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Congencerre countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Conses preventorol	in place of treatment plant B	1,900,000	Akashi and Yasuda(1994)	ΙY	P
Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons Fukui prefecture 40,000 Oka(1997) LY R Gifu prefecture 68,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 330,000 Oka(1997) LY R Tokyo prefecture 390,000 Oka(1997) LY R Nox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlorodane 45,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Construction regulation 75,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 7,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gastric cancer Mass screening for gastric cancer male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R females 5,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R female, 50s 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 660 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Kagoshima prefecture(1985–1994) 3,200 Kusano et al.(1997) LY R Kagoshima prefecture(1985–1994) 3,200 Kusano et al.(1997) LY R Kagoshima prefecture(1985–1994) 3,200 Kusano et al.(1997) LY R Mass screening for breast cancer physical examination(PE) alone 7,500 Okubo et al.(1997) LY R Mass screening for breast cancer physical examination(PE) alone 7,500 Okubo et al.(1997) LY R Mass screening for LY R Mass screening for uncernear Morene 4,000 Kishimoto(1	Ozone laver protection	.,,			•
Fului prefecture40,000Oka(1997)LYRGifu prefecture68,000Oka(1997)LYRHyogo prefecture30,000Oka(1997)LYRTokyo prefecture390,000Oka(1997)LYRNOx raduction regulation75,000Oka(1997)LYRDioxin controlEmergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators7,900Kishimoto et al.(2001)LYREmergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators150,000Kishimoto et al.(2001)LYRCadtrafficTraffic safety facilities for pedestrians27,000Murayama(1991)LYRTraffic safety facilities for pedestrians5,000Kishimoto(1997)LYRTraffic safety facilities for Gifu city30,000Akiyama and Suzuki(1997)LYRCancer screeningCancer screeningCancer screeningCancer screeningMass screening for gastric cancer1,500Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYR	Recovery of chlorofluorocarbons				
Gifu prefecture 10,000 Oka(1997) LY R Hyogo prefecture 300,000 Oka(1997) LY R NOx reduction regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Nox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Long term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 27,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Cibicase prevention> C 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R demales 1,500 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100	Fukui prefecture	40 000	Oka(1997)	IY	R
Child prefecture00.000Oka(1507)L1IAHyogo prefecture130.000Oka(1997)LYRTokyo prefecture390.000Oka(1997)LYRProhibition of chlordane45,000Oka et al.(1997)LYRDioxin controlEmergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators7,900Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYRLong-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators150,000Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYRCong-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators150,000Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYRCong-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators150,000Kishimoto et al. (2001)LYRTraffic safety facilities for pedestrians5,000Kishimoto (1997)LYRTraffic safety facilities for Gifu city30,000Akiyama and Suzuki(1997)LYRCancer screeningCancer screeningCancer screeningLYRMass screening for gastric cancer6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100<	Cifu prefecture	68,000	Oka(1997)		P
Tryogo prefecture 100,000 Oka(197) L1 IV Tokyo prefecture 300,000 Oka(1997) LY R NOx reduction regulation 75,000 Oka(1997) LY R Dioxin control 45,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Dioxin control 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Cafety control> Safety control> Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Congress prevention> Cancer screening 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gifu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R females 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995)	Hyoro prefecture	130,000	Oka(1997)		P
Toryo preduction 530,000 Oka (1997) LY R Nox reduction regulation 75,000 Oka (1997) LY R Dioxin control Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Cong-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Canget straffic Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 27,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY	Tokyo profesture	200,000	Oka(1997)		
NOX reduction regulation 7,500 Oka (1997) L1 R Prohibition of chlordane 45,000 Oka et al.(1997) LY R Dioxin control Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Road traffic Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto (1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for grid city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Clisease prevention> Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 1,000 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R <t< td=""><td>NOv reduction regulation</td><td>75,000</td><td>Oka(1997)</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	NOv reduction regulation	75,000	Oka(1997)		
Promotion of chilorabile 4,000 Oka et al. (1997) L1 R Diskin control Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Road traffic Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 27,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for gates for Gifu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Cancer screening Gancer screening 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 40s 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Ba	Drabibition of ablardana	/5,000	O(ka of a) (1007)		
Diskin Control Emergency countermeasures at municipal incinerators 7,900 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY R Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P <safety control=""> Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P Road traffic Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for Gifu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Clisease prevention> Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 40s 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 800 Sabazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 800 Sabazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female,</safety>	Diavin control	40,000	Oka et al.(1997)	LI	К
Long-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators 1,500 Kishimoto et al. (2001) L1 N Road traffic 150,000 Kishimoto et al. (2001) LY P <safety control=""> Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 27,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for glu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Concer screening Mass screention> 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R females 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R R males, fos 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, f0s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, f0s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, f0s 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, f0s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, f0s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R</safety>	Emergency countermonourse at municipal incinerators	7 000	Kishimata at al (2001)		Б
Congreterine counterines at municipal intrinerators 130,000 Kishindot et al. (2001) L1 P <	Lang-term countermeasures at municipal incinerators	150,000	Kishimoto et al. (2001)		R D
Koarety control> Road traffic Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 27,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians 5,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Traffic safety facilities for Gifu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY P CDisease prevention> Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 50s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R		150,000	Kishimoto et al. (2001)	LI	F
Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians27,000Murayama(1991)LYRTraffic safety facilities for Gifu city30,000Akiyama and Suzuki(1997)LYRTraffic safety facilities for Gifu city30,000Akiyama and Suzuki(1997)LYPClisease prevention>Cancer screeningMass screening for gastric cancer610T suji et al.(1991a)LYRmales610T suji et al.(1991a)LYRfemales1,500T suji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984-1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985-1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987-1992)8,700Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerP1,00Okubo et al.(1991)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo e					
Iraffic safety facilities for pedestrians 2,000 Murayama(1991) LY R Traffic safety facilities for Gifu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY R Concer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R males, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 1,200 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 40s 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 3,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R all (1984–1992) 860 Kishimoto(1997)		07.000	(1001)		-
Traffic safety facilities for Gifu city 30,000 Kishimoto(1997) LY P Clisease prevention> Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R females 1,500 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 60s 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 60s 5,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R all (1984–1992) 860 Kishimoto(1997) LY R <t< td=""><td>I raffic safety facilities for pedestrians</td><td>27,000</td><td>Murayama(1991)</td><td>LY</td><td>R</td></t<>	I raffic safety facilities for pedestrians	27,000	Murayama(1991)	LY	R
Child State Vacinities for Gifu city 30,000 Akiyama and Suzuki(1997) LY P Concer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R males 610 Tsuji et al.(1991a) LY R males 6400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 40s 6,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 50s 2,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R male, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 800 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 4,100 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R female, 70s 2,400 Babazono and Hillman(1995) LY R famale, 1982) 860 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Kagoshima prefecture(1985–1994) 3,200 Kusano et al. (1997) LY <	Traffic safety facilities for pedestrians	5,000	Kishimoto(1997)	LY	R
Closease prevention>Cancer screeningMass screening for gastric cancermales610Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRfemales1,500Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPEFFPEFPPPFPPPPPPPPPPP	Iraffic safety facilities for Gifu city	30,000	Akiyama and Suzuki(1997)	LY	<u> </u>
Cancer screening Mass screening for gastric cancer malesmales610Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRfemales1,500Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984-1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985-1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancer8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRmamography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Kubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987-1992)3,200Kushimoto(1997)LYPall (1987-199	<disease prevention=""></disease>				
Mass screening for gastric cancer males610Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRfemales1,500Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1987–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancer all (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancer physical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRmammograp	Cancer screening				
males610I suji et al.(1991a)LYRfemales1,500Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)800Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancer21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYPPE com	Mass screening for gastric cancer				_
females1,500Tsuji et al.(1991a)LYRmale, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kushimoto(1997)LYRMass coreaning for cancer2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700	males	610	Isuji et al.(1991a)	LY	R
male, 40s6,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)8,60Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancer3,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancer7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYR<	temales	1,500	I suji et al.(1991a)	LY	R
male, 50s2,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYRPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYR	male, 40s	6,400	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
male, 60s1,200Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRmale, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYRPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRAmore screening for capucal capucal4,000Matumese et al.(1907)LYR </td <td>male, 50s</td> <td>2,100</td> <td>Babazono and Hillman(1995)</td> <td>LY</td> <td>R</td>	male, 50s	2,100	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
male, 70s800Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	male, 60s	1,200	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
female, 40s5,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancer7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRAll screener screening for capical capper4,000Matumese et al.(1907)LYR	male, 70s	800	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
female, 50s4,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYR	female, 40s	5,100	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
female, 60s3,100Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRfemale, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYR	female, 50s	4,100	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
female, 70s2,400Babazono and Hillman(1995)LYRall (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	female, 60s	3,100	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
all (1984–1992)860Kishimoto(1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancerall (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	female, 70s	2,400	Babazono and Hillman(1995)	LY	R
Kagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)3,200Kusano et al. (1997)LYRKagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancer all (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancer physical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	all (1984–1992)	860	Kishimoto(1997)	LY	R
Kagoshima prefecture(annual participation)21,000Kusano et al. (1997)LYRMass screening for lung cancer all (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancer physical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	Kagoshima prefecture(1985–1994)	3,200	Kusano et al. (1997)	LY	R
Mass screening for lung cancer all (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancer physical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	Kagoshima prefecture(annual participation)	21,000	Kusano et al. (1997)	LY	R
all (1987–1992)8,700Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for breast cancerphysical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYP	Mass screening for lung cancer				
Mass screening for breast cancer number of the second	all (1987–1992)	8.700	Kishimoto(1997)	LY	R
physical examination(PE) alone7,500Okubo et al.(1991)LYRmammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass correaring for convical concer4,900Matument et al.(1907)LYR	Mass screening for breast cancer	,	,		
mammography(MG)2,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal6,100Okubo et al.(1991)LYPPE combined with MG for all screened women2,700Okubo et al.(1991)LYPall (1987–1992)3,200Kishimoto(1997)LYRMass screening for convical concer4,900Matument et al.(1907)LYR	physical examination(PF) alone	7,500	Okubo et al (1991)	LY	R
PE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal PE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal PE combined with MG for all screened women all (1987–1992) Mass screening for centrical cancer (1900) All (1907) All (190	mammography(MG)	2 100	Okubo et al (1991)	 I Y	P
PE combined with MG for all screened women 2,700 Okubo et al.(1991) LY P all (1987–1992) 3,200 Kishimoto(1997) LY R Mass screening for central cancer 4,900 Matumers et al.(1907) LY R	PE followed by MG if PE findings were abnormal	6 100	Okubo et al (1991)	IY	P
all (1987–1992) All (1987–1992) Mass screening for central cancer 4,000 Matures at al (1997) LY R	PE combined with MG for all screened women	2 700	Okubo et al (1991)	IY	P
Mass screening for central cancer (1007) LT II	all (1987–1992)	3 200	Kishimoto(1997)	IY	R
	Mass screening for cervical cancer	4 900	Matsunara et al (1007)		R

Mass screening for colorectal cancer			_
two day method of screening program: male	4,100	Tsuji et al.(1991b) LY	P
two day method of screening program: female	5,100	Tsuji et al.(1991b) LY	P
total colonoscopy for workup strategy: male	3,300	Isuji et al.(1991b) LY	Р
total colonoscopy for workup strategy: female	4,100	Tsuji et al.(1991b) LY	P
starting age of screening: 40	1,800	Shimbo et al. (1994) LY	P
starting age of screening: 50	1,700	Shimbo et al. (1994) LY	P
starting age of screening: 60	2,100	Shimbo et al. (1994) LY	Р
Mass screening for prostatic cancer			_
age 55-59	200	Nakagawa et al. (1997) LY	Р
age 60-69	<0 (0	Nakagawa et al. (1997) LY	P
age /0-/9	<0	Nakagawa et al. (1997) LY	Р
	1 000		
Smoke cessation with Nicotine 11S	1,800	Fujino et al. (1994) LY	Р
Human Immunodeticiency virus infection(HIV) prevention	140.000		
HIV screening for the blood donors (in average)	140,000	Ranman et al. (1995) Li	
HIV screening for the blood donors (in Tokyo)	51,000	Ranman et al. (1995) Li	
Partner notification program	570	Ranman et al. (1998) Li	Р
	4 250	Katavaluma at al (2000) IV	Б
Discount rate 3%	4,300	Katayakma et al. (2000) LT	R
Discourt rate 5%	20,000	Ratayakina et al. (2000) ET	R
Hypertensive sere			
male	5 100	Hissonishi(1005) IV	D
female	7 000	Hisamichi(1995) LT	P
HMG-CoA reductase inhibitor (male 50)	/,000	Hisashire (1993) LV/OALV	
HMG-CoA reductase inhibitor (finale, 50)	7500-8600/7180	Hisashige (1999) LY/QALY	R
<pre>/Medical treatment></pre>	7000 0000/ 7100	Thisashige (1999) ET/ GAET	IX
Cancer treatment			
Lung cancer treatment (male 60)	1 500	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Colorectal cancer treatment (male 60)	450	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Gastric cancer treatment (male, 60)	300	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Prostatic cancer treatment (male, 60)	300	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Lung cancer treatment (female, 60)	1,300	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Colorectal cancer treatment (female, 60)	300	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Cervical cancer treatment (female, 60)	300	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Breast cancer treatment (female, 60)	200	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Gastric cancer treatment (female, 60)	200	Koinuma (1999) QALY	R
Breast cancer treatment			
Conservative treatment of breast cancer	320	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
Postoperative supprtive care (CMF)	160	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
Postoperative supprtive care (TAM)	440	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
Interferon therapy for liver cirrhosis type C	490/620	Hisashige(1999) LY/QALY	R
Organ transplant		-	
Liver transplant	3600-8700	Miyasaka and Ohi (1994) LY	Р
Heart transplant	4700-9300	Miyasaka and Ohi (1994) LY	Р
Liver transplant from a living donor			
6 years followup	5,240	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
life-time followup	4,440	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
Heart transplant			
8 years followup	2640/2380	Hisashige(1999) LY/QALY	Р
life-time followup	1360/1210	Hisashige(1999) LY/QALY	Р
Acute lymphocytic leukemia treatment			
Chemotherapy (5 years followup)	4,500	Ohta (1996) LY	R
Chemotherapy (life-time followup)	760	Ohta (1996) LY	R
Bone marrow transplantation (5 years followup)	3,300	Ohta (1996) LY	R
Bone marrow transplantation (life-time followup)	150	Ohta (1996) LY	R
Chronic lymphocytic leukemia treatment			
Chemotherapy (5 years followup)	1,550	Hisashige (2000) LY	R
Chemotherapy (life-time followup)	590	Hisashige (2000) LY	R
Bone marrow transplantation (5 years followup)	2,940	Hisashige (2000) LY	R
Bone marrow transplantation (life-time followup)	330	Hisashige (2000) LY	R
Coronary artery disease treatment			
Coronary artery bypass grafting(CABG) in place of	8,400	Hisamichi(1995) QALY	Р
percutaneous transluminal coronary angioplasty(PT)	CA)		
for exertional angina pectoris (two vessel diseas	e)		_
Medical treatment (single vessel disease)	5,020	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
CABG (two-vessel disease)	5,240	Hisashige (2000) QALY	R
CABG (three-vessel disease)	970	Hisashige (2000) QALY	К

"R" represents retrospective analysis and "P" represents prospective analysis.

Appendix B. References for cost-effectiveness analyses

- Akashi, T. and Yasuda, Y., 1994. Evaluation of Environmental Policies Based on Risk-Benefit Analysis – The Cost per Life-Saved in the High-level Treatment of Water Supply-. Japanese Journal of Risk Analysis 4(1), 96-104 (in Japanese).
- Akiyama, T. and Suzuki, T., 1997. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Transport Safety
 Measures Using Genetic Algorithm, Proceedings of 17th Japan Society of Traffic
 Engineers Meeting 93-96 (in Japanese).
- Babazono, A. and Hillman, A., 1995. Declining Cost-Effectiveness of Screening for
 Disease: The Case of Gastric Cancer in Japan. International Journal of Technology
 Assessment in Health Care, 11(2), 354-364.
- Fujino, S., Sato, K., Imai, H., Akazawa, T. and Ogawa, K., 1994. Socioeconomic Evaluation of the Effect of Nicotine TTS. Journal of Clinical Therapeutics & Medicine 10(7), 1477-1492 (in Japanese).
- Hisamichi, S., 1995. Research on the cost and benefit concerning cardiovascular disease, Ministry of Health and Welfare (in Japanese).
- Hisashige, A., 1999. Research Report on the Healthcare Technology Assessment, Ministry of Health and Welfare (in Japanese).
- Hisashige, A., 2000. Cost-Effectiveness of Cancer Therapy. Japanese Journal of Cancer Chemotherapy 9, 1347-1353 (in Japanese)
- Kajihara, H., Ishizuka, S., Fushimi, A., Masuda, A. and Nakanishi, J., 2000. Population risk assessment of ambient benzene and evaluation of benzene regulation in gasoline in Japan. Environmental Engineering and Policy 2(1), 1-9.
- Katayama, T., Mikasa, H. and Hisashige, A., 2000. Economic Evaluation of Hepatitis Type B Viruses Vaccine. Japanese Journal of Hygiene 55(1), 343 (in Japanese).

- Kishimoto, A., 1997. A Comparative Analysis of Cost-Effectiveness of Risk Reduction. Japanese Journal of Risk Analysis 8(2), 165-173.
- Koinuma, N., 1999. Economic Analysis of Cancer Treatment. Cancer Treatment and Host 11(3), 268-279 (in Japanese).
- Kusano, K., Shibue, T., Saitoh, H., Chuman, Y., Hamahata, M., Mishige, K., Arima, T., Shinmaki, K. and Hnamure, B., 1997. A Study on Cost-Effectiveness of Gatric Mass Survey – Especially Relations to Accuracy of Closed Examinations -. Nihon Shokaki Shudankenshin Gakkaishi, 35(1), 53-60 (in Japanese).
- Matsunaga, G., Tsuji, I., Sato, S., Fukao, A., Hisamichi, S., and Yajima, A., 1997. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Mass Screening for Cervical Cancer in Japan. Journal of Epidemiology, 7(3), 135-141.
- Miyasaka, M. and Ohi, G., 1994. Cost-Benefit and Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Organ Transportation from Brain-dead Donors in Japan – How Can It be Fair? Bioethics 4(1), 25-29 (in Japanese).
- Murayama, T., 1991. A Risk Assessment of Asbestos Pollution in Residential Environment, Environmental Science 4(2), 79-101 (in Japanese).
- Nakagawa, S., Ebisui, K., Nakanishi, H., Kanemitsu, N. and Watanabe, H., 1997. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Prostatic Cancer Screening. Nihon Hinyokika Gakkaishi, 88(10), 892-899 (in Japanese).
- Nakanishi, J., 1995. Environmental Risk, Iwanami (in Japanese).
- Nakanishi, J., Oka, T. and Gamo, M., 1998. Risk/Benefit Analysis of Prohibition of the Mercury Electrode Process in Caustic Soda Production. Environmental Engineering and Policy 1, 3-9.
- Ohta, K., 1996. Research Report on the Organ Transplant Technology Development, Ministry of Health and Welfare (in Japanese).

Oka, T., 1997. Lectures on Environmental Economics (unpublished manuscript).

- Oka, T., Gamo, M. and Nakanishi, J., 1997. Risk/Benefit Analysis of the Prohibition of Chlordene in Japan: An Estimate Based on Risk Assessment Integrating the Cancer Risk and the Noncancer Risk. Japanese Journal of Risk Analysis 8(2), 174-186.
- Okubo, I., Glick, H., Frumkin, H., and Eisenberg, J. M., 1991. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Mass Screening for Breast Cancer in Japan. Cancer, 67, 2021-2029.
- Rahman, M., Fukui, T. and Asai, A., 1998. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Partner Notification Program for Human Immunodeficiency Virus Infection in Japan. Journal of Epidemiology, 8(2), 123-128.
- Rahman, M., Tsutsui, T., Kamae, I. and Takahashi, T., 1995. Prediction of Cost-Effectiveness for Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) Screening Program in Japan. Journal of Epidemiology, 8(1), 33-38.
- Shimbo, T., Glick, H. and Eisenberg, J., 1994. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Strategies for Colorectal Cancer Screening in Japan. International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care, 10(3), 359-375.
- Tsuji, I., Fukao, A., Shoji, T., Kuwajima, I., Sugawara, T., and Hisamichi, S., 1991a. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Screening for Gastric Cancer in Japan. Tohoku Journal of Experimental Medicine, 164, 279-284.
- Tsuji, I., Fukao, A., Sugawara, T., Shoji, T., Kuwajima, I., and Hisamichi, S., 1991b. Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of Screening for Colorectal Cancer in Japan. Tohoku Journal of Experimental Medicine 164, 269-278.

References

Elixhauser, A., Halpern, M., Schmier, J. and Luce, B. R., 1998. Health Care CBA and CEA from 1991 to 1996: An updated bibliography. Medical Care 36 (5 Suppl), MS1-9,

MS16-147.

- Freemantle, N. and Mason, J., 1997. Publication Bias in Clinical Trials and Economic Analyses. Pharmacoeconomics 12, 10-16.
- Gamo, M., Oka, T. and Nakanishi, J., 1995. A Method Evaluating Population Risks from Chemical Exposure: A Case Study Concerning Prohibition of Chlordane Use in Japan.
 Regulatory Toxicology and Pharmacology 21, 151-157.
- Gamo, M., Oka, T. and Nakanishi, J., 2001. Ranking Risks of Chemical Substances in Japan. (in press)
- Harvard Center for Cancer Prevention, 1996. Harvard Report on Cancer Prevention,Volume 1: Causes of Human Cancer. Cancer Causes & Control: An InternationalJournal of Studies of Cancer in Human Populations 7 Suppl.
- Kanovos, P., Trueman, P. and Bosilevac, A., 2000. Can Economic Evaluation Guidelines Improve Efficiency in Resource Allocation? The Cases of Portugal, the Netherlands, Finland, and the United Kingdom. International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care 16, 1179-1192.
- Kishimoto, A., Oka, T., Yoshida, K. and Nakanishi, J., 2001. Cost Effectiveness of Reducing Dioxin Emissions from Municipal Solid Waste Incinerators in Japan. Environmental Science and Technology (in press)
- Morello-Frosch, R. A., Woodruff, T., Axelrad, D. A., and Caldwell, J. C., 2000. Air Toxics and Health Risks in California: The Public Health Implications of Outdoor Concentrations. Risk Analysis 20(2), 273-291.
- Murray, C. J. L., Evans, D. B., Acharya, A. and Baltussen, R. M. P. M., 2000.Development of WHO Guidelines on Generalized Cost-Effectiveness Analysis.Health Economics, 9(3), 235-251.

Ramsberg, J. A. L. and Sjoberg, L., 1997. The Cost-Effectiveness of Lifesaving

Interventions in Sweden. Risk Analysis 17(4), 467-478.

Tengs, T. O., Adams, M. E., Pliskin, S. P., Safran, D. G., Siegel, J. E., Weinstein, M. C. and Graham, J. D., 1995. Five-Hundred Life-Saving Interventions and Their Cost-Effectiveness, Risk Analysis 15(3), 369-390.